

MIT OpenCourseWare  
<http://ocw.mit.edu>

21A.215 Medical Anthropology  
Fall 2008

For information about citing these materials or our Terms of Use, visit: <http://ocw.mit.edu/terms>.

### Questions on Luhrmann 84-293

1. What have you heard about the “cadaver experience” in medical school, mentioned on p. 86? Would you want to donate your body to a medical school’s anatomy lab?
2. “Most medical students seem to feel tremendous fear that their detachment will not hold.” Have you ever felt a similar fear? If so, how does it differ from what Luhrmann is talking about? Does this fear continue into medical practice, do you think?
3. Compare Luhrmann’s description of residents treating seriously mentally ill patients with what you saw in the video “Back from Madness.”
4. “Medicine has a macho culture passed on from brutalized class to brutalized class.” Do you agree? If you do, why such brutalization? Compare this statement (and Luhrmann’s discussion of the novel *The House of God* on p. 92) to the piece by Gordon on hospital slang.
5. What is most essential for ensuring that young doctors do well and are evaluated by their superiors as doing well?
6. On p. 93 Luhrmann discusses the residents’ “clear sense of the difference between doctor and patient.” What is this?
7. What disturbed you most about the psychiatric hospitals that were delivering sub-optimal care?
8. What were the differences between medicine and psychiatry that residents needed to learn?
9. On p. 100 Luhrmann speaks of a kind of sex stereotyping of the biomedical and the psychotherapeutic. Discuss.
10. What is “transference”? (p. 104)
11. How is the therapy a young psychiatrist undergoes different from a nonpsychiatrist’s?
12. On p. 108 Luhrmann says that if you don’t convey the fact that you cry in therapy, your fellow residents will wonder whether there is something wrong with you. Compare to the “macho culture” of medicine mentioned above and reconcile the two sets of values.
13. “To learn how not to hurt a patient, how to construct a relationship in which a patient is not limited by the therapist, creates a world of paradox.” (p. 111) Compare to how one learns how to be a competent physician in medicine.
14. Luhrmann states that the teaching in psychotherapy insists on the doctor potentially being a source of harm to the patient in a way that biomedical teaching does not, that the arrow

- of harm flies from doctor to patient, not the other way. Yet a resident's emotional experience of admissions teaches him/her to guard him/herself against a patient. Discuss.
15. On p. 125 Luhrmann discusses the ways in which a patient, Terry, tried to stay in a hospital psychiatric ward. Why?
  16. On p. 135, Nick wanted "to figure out how the new medication was affecting her." Compare to the video "Back from Madness."
  17. On p. 140, Luhrmann discusses the contradiction between patient-as-child and patient-as-adult. Describe the contradiction.
  18. On p. 141 Luhrmann discusses what psychiatric staff wanted her to communicate to the misunderstanding public about psychiatric illness. Discuss the opposite views of the psychodynamically oriented and biomedically oriented.
  19. What did you think of the treatment policies of the Norton Inn—pp. 146-157?
  20. Discuss the shame felt by the residents in the prestige-conscious residencies who had chosen not to go into research (p. 159).
  21. Luhrmann discusses a psychiatrist who was chided by his supervisor for wondering if a certain patient's panic attacks could have an organic basis. Describe (p. 173).
  22. Shapin states that "Scientists know so much about the natural world by knowing so much about whom they can trust" (p. 178). Discuss.
  23. Describe the conflict over diagnosing PMS on pp. 180-181.
  24. Luhrmann mentions a Freudian slip on p. 185. What is this?
  25. Discuss how psychodynamically oriented psychiatrists evaluate someone's work by evaluating their self-presentation, contrasting it with the science model.
  26. "Psychoanalysis is a powerful expression of the modern age's belief in authenticity." (p. 200) What does Luhrmann mean?
  27. Describe the major factors leading to the "split" Luhrmann describes.
  28. On p. 207 Luhrmann discusses the "Dodo hypothesis." What is it? Why does it have this name? Discuss the findings that supported this hypothesis; how do they strengthen or weaken the argument that dynamic psychotherapy is effective?
  29. On p. 209 Luhrmann discusses a "now-famous" study of the effectiveness of psychopharmacology and psychotherapy. What is it? What did it find?

30. Describe the uphill battle psychotherapists face in the era of managed care.
31. What is insight? What is its role in psychoanalysis?
32. Describe “deinstitutionalization.”
33. Luhrmann talks about “the crisis of managed care.” What is the worst feature of this crisis, in your opinion?
34. Describe some of the research that shows the weaknesses of putting the psychiatrically ill into hospitals.
35. “We will kill someone.” (p. 256) Describe this crisis.
36. Luhrmann cites a psychotherapist who disagrees with the idea that the patient who is reacting in an unusual and unhealthy way that is diagnosable has an illness, meaning a brain disorder. What are his reasons?
37. If you agree that the idea of an illness—a brain disorder—is wrong, discuss the implications for treatment.
38. Luhrmann’s last chapter is on “madness and moral responsibility.” Describe 3 or more points made.
39. How do you react when you encounter someone “not all there,” for instance, a psychotic panhandler?
40. Are psychiatric patients innocent sufferers? Are deeply depressed people who deliberately take an overdose innocent? How do people with cancer remain humans, persons, in a way that psychotics don’t?
41. Luhrmann discusses physicians’ response to patients who somehow seem responsible/to blame for their illness to some degree. Describe what Hahn said about Barry, the internist, with respect to this issue. Describe Gordon’s analysis of the relationship between a patient’s blame/responsibility and being the target of slang in a hospital.
42. Luhrmann points out that “normality” is a difficult concept in psychiatry: healthy people are like this and unhealthy ones like that. List three ways the individuals in the video “Back from Madness” illustrate this difficulty.
43. Reread the bottom of p. 277 in Luhrmann and the top of p. 278. Make the point she is making in your own words. Then, once again, provide a definition of *disease*, and *illness*.
44. We have discussed the positive consequences of seeing psychiatric patients as medically ill. What are the negative consequences of this, the “moral danger”?